WEST BENGAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL

Present-

Hon'ble Justice Soumitra Pal, Hon'ble Chairman. & Hon'ble Dr. Subesh Kumar Das, Administrative Member.

Case No. OA 194 of 2018. CHANDRANI MITRA - VS- THE STATE OF W.B. & ORS.

Carial No. and	Order of the Tribunal with signature	Office action with date
Serial No. and Date of order.	Order of the Tribunal with signature 2	and dated signature of parties when necessary
1		3
2	For the Applicant : Mr. P. Ghosh,	
11.9.2018.	Advocate.	
	For the State Respondent : Mr. S. Ghosh,	
	Advocate.	
	For the A.G. (A & E) W.B. : None.	
	In this application the applicant has prayed	
	for a direction upon the Respondents, particularly on the	
	Secretary, Health and Family Welfare Department,	
	Kolkata, now re-designated as Additional Chief Secretary,	
	Health and Family Welfare Department, Kolkata, to grant	
	family pension in her favour, being an unmarried	
	daughter of the State Government employee, in terms of	
	the relevant government Order. Prayers have also been	
	made to dispose the representations dated 18 th	
	December, 2018, 12 th January, 2018 and 24 th February,	
	2018.	
	It appears that Manjusree Majumder, a staff	
	nurse under the State had expired on 22 nd March, 2017	
	leaving behind two unmarried daughters – the applicant	
	and Kamalika Mitra, the younger daughter.	
	It is submitted by Mr. S. Ghosh, learned	
	advocate for the State Respondents on instruction that	

CHANDRANI WITTRA.
••••

Form No.

Vs.

Case No. **OA 194 of 2018.**

THE STATE OF W.B. & ORS.

under the scheme framed by the State family pension is admissible first to the minor daughter below 25 years of age. Therefore, Kamalika Mitra and not Chandrani Mitra is first entitled to get minor family pension upto the age of 25 . So far as the case of Chandrani Mitra — the applicant , an unmarried daughter is concerned, it would be considered after the issue of family pension to Kamalika Mitra, other minor daughter, is completed. Mr. P. Ghosh, learned advocate appearing on behalf of the applicant submits that appropriate order may be passed for grant of family pension in accordance with law. On a query, it is submitted by the learned advocate for the applicant, on instruction, from the applicant and also from Kamalika Mitra, who are present in Court, that in the year 1994 their mother had a judicial separation with their father Biswanath Mitra. Having heard the learned advocates for the parties and considering the facts and circumstances of the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,			
under the scheme framed by the State family pension is admissible first to the minor daughter below 25 years of age. Therefore, Kamalika Mitra and not Chandrani Mitra is first entitled to get minor family pension upto the age of 25 . So far as the case of Chandrani Mitra – the applicant , an unmarried daughter is concerned, it would be considered after the issue of family pension to Kamalika Mitra, other minor daughter, is completed. Mr. P. Ghosh, learned advocate appearing on behalf of the applicant submits that appropriate order may be passed for grant of family pension in accordance with law. On a query, it is submitted by the learned advocate for the applicant, on instruction, from the applicant and also from Kamalika Mitra, who are present in Court, that in the year 1994 their mother had a judicial separation with their father Biswanath Mitra. Having heard the learned advocates for the parties and considering the facts and circumstances of the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,		Order of the Tribunal with signature	
under the scheme framed by the State family pension is admissible first to the minor daughter below 25 years of age. Therefore, Kamalika Mitra and not Chandrani Mitra is first entitled to get minor family pension upto the age of 25. So far as the case of Chandrani Mitra – the applicant, an unmarried daughter is concerned, it would be considered after the issue of family pension to Kamalika Mitra, other minor daughter, is completed. Mr. P. Ghosh, learned advocate appearing on behalf of the applicant submits that appropriate order may be passed for grant of family pension in accordance with law. On a query, it is submitted by the learned advocate for the applicant, on instruction, from the applicant and also from Kamalika Mitra, who are present in Court, that in the year 1994 their mother had a judicial separation with their father Biswanath Mitra. Having heard the learned advocates for the parties and considering the facts and circumstances of the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,		2	of parties when necessary
admissible first to the minor daughter below 25 years of age. Therefore, Kamalika Mitra and not Chandrani Mitra is first entitled to get minor family pension upto the age of 25 . So far as the case of Chandrani Mitra – the applicant , an unmarried daughter is concerned, it would be considered after the issue of family pension to Kamalika Mitra, other minor daughter, is completed. Mr. P. Ghosh, learned advocate appearing on behalf of the applicant submits that appropriate order may be passed for grant of family pension in accordance with law. On a query, it is submitted by the learned advocate for the applicant, on instruction, from the applicant and also from Kamalika Mitra, who are present in Court, that in the year 1994 their mother had a judicial separation with their father Biswanath Mitra. Having heard the learned advocates for the parties and considering the facts and circumstances of the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,	1		3
age. Therefore, Kamalika Mitra and not Chandrani Mitra is first entitled to get minor family pension upto the age of 25 . So far as the case of Chandrani Mitra — the applicant , an unmarried daughter is concerned, it would be considered after the issue of family pension to Kamalika Mitra, other minor daughter, is completed. Mr. P. Ghosh, learned advocate appearing on behalf of the applicant submits that appropriate order may be passed for grant of family pension in accordance with law. On a query, it is submitted by the learned advocate for the applicant, on instruction, from the applicant and also from Kamalika Mitra, who are present in Court, that in the year 1994 their mother had a judicial separation with their father Biswanath Mitra. Having heard the learned advocates for the parties and considering the facts and circumstances of the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,		under the scheme framed by the State family pension is	
is first entitled to get minor family pension upto the age of 25 . So far as the case of Chandrani Mitra — the applicant , an unmarried daughter is concerned, it would be considered after the issue of family pension to Kamalika Mitra, other minor daughter, is completed. Mr. P. Ghosh, learned advocate appearing on behalf of the applicant submits that appropriate order may be passed for grant of family pension in accordance with law. On a query, it is submitted by the learned advocate for the applicant, on instruction, from the applicant and also from Kamalika Mitra, who are present in Court, that in the year 1994 their mother had a judicial separation with their father Biswanath Mitra . Having heard the learned advocates for the parties and considering the facts and circumstances of the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,		admissible first to the minor daughter below 25 years of	
of 25 . So far as the case of Chandrani Mitra – the applicant , an unmarried daughter is concerned, it would be considered after the issue of family pension to Kamalika Mitra, other minor daughter, is completed. Mr. P. Ghosh, learned advocate appearing on behalf of the applicant submits that appropriate order may be passed for grant of family pension in accordance with law. On a query, it is submitted by the learned advocate for the applicant, on instruction, from the applicant and also from Kamalika Mitra, who are present in Court, that in the year 1994 their mother had a judicial separation with their father Biswanath Mitra . Having heard the learned advocates for the parties and considering the facts and circumstances of the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,		age. Therefore, Kamalika Mitra and not Chandrani Mitra	
applicant , an unmarried daughter is concerned, it would be considered after the issue of family pension to Kamalika Mitra, other minor daughter, is completed. Mr. P. Ghosh, learned advocate appearing on behalf of the applicant submits that appropriate order may be passed for grant of family pension in accordance with law. On a query, it is submitted by the learned advocate for the applicant, on instruction, from the applicant and also from Kamalika Mitra, who are present in Court, that in the year 1994 their mother had a judicial separation with their father Biswanath Mitra. Having heard the learned advocates for the parties and considering the facts and circumstances of the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,		is first entitled to get minor family pension upto the age	
be considered after the issue of family pension to Kamalika Mitra, other minor daughter, is completed. Mr. P. Ghosh, learned advocate appearing on behalf of the applicant submits that appropriate order may be passed for grant of family pension in accordance with law. On a query, it is submitted by the learned advocate for the applicant, on instruction, from the applicant and also from Kamalika Mitra, who are present in Court, that in the year 1994 their mother had a judicial separation with their father Biswanath Mitra. Having heard the learned advocates for the parties and considering the facts and circumstances of the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,		of 25 . So far as the case of Chandrani Mitra – the	
Kamalika Mitra, other minor daughter, is completed. Mr. P. Ghosh, learned advocate appearing on behalf of the applicant submits that appropriate order may be passed for grant of family pension in accordance with law. On a query, it is submitted by the learned advocate for the applicant, on instruction, from the applicant and also from Kamalika Mitra, who are present in Court, that in the year 1994 their mother had a judicial separation with their father Biswanath Mitra. Having heard the learned advocates for the parties and considering the facts and circumstances of the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,		applicant, an unmarried daughter is concerned, it would	
Mr. P. Ghosh, learned advocate appearing on behalf of the applicant submits that appropriate order may be passed for grant of family pension in accordance with law. On a query, it is submitted by the learned advocate for the applicant, on instruction, from the applicant and also from Kamalika Mitra, who are present in Court, that in the year 1994 their mother had a judicial separation with their father Biswanath Mitra. Having heard the learned advocates for the parties and considering the facts and circumstances of the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,		be considered after the issue of family pension to	
on behalf of the applicant submits that appropriate order may be passed for grant of family pension in accordance with law. On a query, it is submitted by the learned advocate for the applicant, on instruction, from the applicant and also from Kamalika Mitra, who are present in Court, that in the year 1994 their mother had a judicial separation with their father Biswanath Mitra. Having heard the learned advocates for the parties and considering the facts and circumstances of the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,		Kamalika Mitra, other minor daughter, is completed.	
may be passed for grant of family pension in accordance with law. On a query, it is submitted by the learned advocate for the applicant, on instruction, from the applicant and also from Kamalika Mitra, who are present in Court, that in the year 1994 their mother had a judicial separation with their father Biswanath Mitra. Having heard the learned advocates for the parties and considering the facts and circumstances of the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,		Mr. P. Ghosh, learned advocate appearing	
with law. On a query, it is submitted by the learned advocate for the applicant, on instruction, from the applicant and also from Kamalika Mitra, who are present in Court, that in the year 1994 their mother had a judicial separation with their father Biswanath Mitra. Having heard the learned advocates for the parties and considering the facts and circumstances of the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,		on behalf of the applicant submits that appropriate order	
advocate for the applicant, on instruction, from the applicant and also from Kamalika Mitra, who are present in Court, that in the year 1994 their mother had a judicial separation with their father Biswanath Mitra. Having heard the learned advocates for the parties and considering the facts and circumstances of the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,		may be passed for grant of family pension in accordance	
applicant and also from Kamalika Mitra, who are present in Court, that in the year 1994 their mother had a judicial separation with their father Biswanath Mitra. Having heard the learned advocates for the parties and considering the facts and circumstances of the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,		with law. On a query, it is submitted by the learned	
in Court, that in the year 1994 their mother had a judicial separation with their father Biswanath Mitra . Having heard the learned advocates for the parties and considering the facts and circumstances of the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,		advocate for the applicant, on instruction, from the	
separation with their father Biswanath Mitra. Having heard the learned advocates for the parties and considering the facts and circumstances of the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,		applicant and also from Kamalika Mitra, who are present	
Having heard the learned advocates for the parties and considering the facts and circumstances of the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,		in Court, that in the year 1994 their mother had a judicial	
parties and considering the facts and circumstances of the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,		separation with their father Biswanath Mitra .	
the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,		Having heard the learned advocates for the	
respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,		parties and considering the facts and circumstances of	
entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,		the case, since it is submitted on behalf of the State	
		respondents that Kamalika being the minor daughter is	
Gandhi Memorial Hospital Kalvani Nadia — the		entitled to get family pension first, the Superintendent,	
Ganani Memonai Nospitai, Kaiyani, Nadia — the		Gandhi Memorial Hospital, Kalyani, Nadia – the	

CHANDRANI MITRA.
Vs.

Case I	No.	OA	194	of	2018.
--------	-----	----	-----	----	-------

Form No.

THE STATE OF W.B. & ORS.

		Office estimates with data
Serial No. and	Order of the Tribunal with signature	Office action with date and dated signature
Date of order.	2	of parties when necessary
1		3
	Respondent no. 2 shall send the proposal for grant of	
	family pension in favour of Kamalika Mitra to the	
	Accountant General, West Bengal, Kolkata within six	
	weeks from the date of presentation of a copy of the	
	certified copy of this order. After receiving the	
	documents the Accountant General will dispose of the	
	matter by passing necessary orders within six weeks. If it	
	is found that after completion of formalities that	
	Chandrani Mitra, the unmarried daughter of the	
	applicant, is entitled to family pension, it will be	
	considered in accordance with law within four weeks	
	thereafter.	
	(Subesh Kumar Das) (Soumitra Pal)	
	Member(A). Chairman.	
Skg.		

	CHANDRANI MITRA.
Form No.	
	Vs.
Case No. OA 194 of 2018.	THE STATE OF W.B. & ORS.

Serial No. and	Order of the Tribunal with signature	Office action with date
Date of order. 1	2	and dated signature of parties when necessa 3